

City Council

Monday 25 June 2018

PRESENT:

Councillor Sam Davey, in the Chair.

Councillor Mavin, Vice Chair.

Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Mrs Bridgeman, Buchan, Churchill, Coker, Cook, Corvid, Dann, Darcy, Deacon, Derrick, Downie, Drear, Evans OBE, Fletcher, K Foster, Goslin, Haydon, Hendy, James, Jordan, Kelly, Michael Leaves, Samantha Leaves, Loveridge, Lowry, McDonald, Morris, Murphy, Nicholson, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Penberthy, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Singh, P Smith, R Smith, Stevens, Jon Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler, Wiggins and Winter.

Apologies for absence: Councillors Carson, Mrs Johnson, Dr Mahony, Neil and Kate Taylor

The meeting started at 2.00 pm and finished at 7.05 pm.

Note: The full discussion can be viewed on the webcast of the City Council meeting at www.plymouth.gov.uk. At a future meeting, the Council will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

9. Minutes

The minutes of the meetings held on the held on 26 March and 18 May 2018 were agreed.

10. Declarations of Interest

The following declarations of interest were made by councillors in accordance with the code of conduct in respect of items under consideration at the meeting -

Name	Minute Number	Reason	Interest
Councillor Winter	20.3	Employee of Babcock Devonport Dockyard Limited	Disclosable Pecuniary Interest
Councillor Wiggins	16	Land in the area of West Devon covered by the Plan	Disclosable Pecuniary Interest
Councillor Nicholson	20.3	Employee of Babcock Devonport Dockyard Limited	Personal Interest

11. Appointments to Committees, Outside Bodies etc

Council agreed the following appointments notified to the Acting Monitoring Officer -

Committee	Previous Member	New Member
Education and Children's Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Panel	Philippa Davey	Councillor Gareth Derrick
Tamar Estuaries Consultative Forum	Councillor Darren Winter	Councillor Pam Buchan
Independent Remuneration Panel	Vacancy	Jane Hopkinson

12. **Announcements**

a) Lord Mayor

- The late former Councillor Mrs Delia Ford
- The late Ian Knight, former Plymouth City Council Employee
- Queens Birthday Honours
- Visiting colleagues from Northern Arizona University in Flagstaff
- Arts for Hearts Award
- Building Regulations Accreditation
- Nelson Project – Planning Excellence in Housing
- Nelson Project - Planning Excellence in Health and Wellbeing
- The Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy - Public Finance Leader of the Year – Andrew Hardingham

b) The Leader, Cabinet Members or Chairs of Committees

- The Leader
 - Meeting with Minister for Defence Procurement
 - Meeting with British Land
 - Local Election 2018
- Councillor Sue Dann, Cabinet Member for Environment and Strategic Street Scene
 - Plastic Free Plymouth
 - Street Scene Service Priorities
- Councillor Sue McDonald, Cabinet Member for Children and Young People
 - Together for Childhood
- Councillor Ian Tuffin, Cabinet Member for Health and Adult Social Care
 - Compassionate Plymouth
- Council Chris Penberthy, Cabinet Member for Housing and Co-operative Development

- Primrose Park, Whiteleigh
- Armed Forces Covenant
- Councillor Jon Taylor, Cabinet Member for Education, Skills and Transformation
 - Plymouth Studio School

13. **Questions by the Public**

There was one question from a member of the public –

Question submitted by: Vashti Fletcher
<p>To the Cabinet Member for Environment and Street Scene</p> <p>Why are there no bins or ashtrays on the Drakes Circus side of Exeter street; why are Kingdom employed by PCC to entrap people with littering PCN's in this area – when on private land, when dropping something biodegradable and where there are no litter or cigarette facilities provided by the council or the land owner?</p>
<p>Response:</p> <p>Under the previous administration, Kingdom Services were contracted to provide increased environmental enforcement in Plymouth, for a pilot of 12 months. Kingdom Services have a proven track record of delivering improvements in environmental protection issues, and operate within a defined legal framework.</p> <p>The Environmental Protection Act 1990 applies to any place in the open air where access is permitted without payment, so would still apply even if on private land. The only caveat to this would be if the landowner had given explicit permission that litter could be dropped on their land.</p> <p>Legally, littering covers anything thrown down, dropped or otherwise deposited. Some things that people may perceive to be biodegradable can take a long time to biodegrade; for example, cigarette butts are estimated to take at least 18 months. This means that they would be visible as litter on the streets for a significant period of time.</p> <p>It is the responsibility of each of us individually to deal with our own rubbish. Rubbish should be carried to the nearest available bin, or taken home with you if one is not available.</p> <p>Councillor Dann, Cabinet Member for Environment and Streetscene</p>

14. **Corporate Plan 2018 - 2022**

Councillor Evans OBE (Leader) proposed the Corporate Plan 2018-2022 for Council approval, Councillor Haydon (Cabinet Member for Customer Focus and Community Safety) seconded the proposals.

Following a vote the council agreed to approve the Corporate Plan 2018-2022.

For the motion (27)

Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Haydon, Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, McDonald, Morris, Murphy, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Penberthy, Rennie, Singh, P Smith, Stevens, J Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Winter, Wheeler, Mavin, Buchan, Goslin, Corvid and Derrick.

Against the motion (0)

Abstentions (23)

Lord Mayor, Councillors Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Churchill, Darcy, Deacon, Downie, Drear, Fletcher, Foster, James, Jordan, Kelly, Leaves, Mrs Leaves, Nicholson, Mrs Pengelly, Wigens, Mrs Loveridge, Cook and R Smith.

Absent / Did Not Vote (6)

Councillors Dr Mahony, Mrs Bridgeman, Neil, Carson, K Taylor and Mrs Johnson.

15. **Financial Outturn 2017/18 and Finance Monitoring (incl Capital) Quarter 4**

Councillor Mark Lowry (Cabinet Member for Finance) proposed the Financial Outturn 2017/18 and Finance Monitoring (incl. Capital) Quarter 4 for information, Councillor Dann (Cabinet Member for Environment and Street scene) seconded the proposals.

Following a short debate the council noted the report.

16. **Plymouth and South West Devon Joint Local Plan**

Councillor Coker (Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning and Infrastructure) proposed recommendations in relation to the Plymouth and South West Devon Joint Local Plan for Council approval, Councillor Evans OBE (Leader) seconded the proposals.

Following a vote the council agreed to authorise the Service Director for Strategic Planning and Infrastructure in consultation with the Leader, Portfolio Holder for Strategic Planning and Infrastructure and the Plymouth and South West Devon Joint Local Plan Steering Group, to consider any potential Main Modifications to the Plymouth and South West Devon Joint Local Plan, if suggested by the Inspectors in Interim Findings and if agreed to make a request to the Inspector to make changes to the Joint Local Plan and proceed to public consultation on the Main Modifications in accordance with section 20(7) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004

For the motion (48)

Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Haydon, Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, McDonald, Morris, Murphy, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Penberthy, Rennie, Singh, P Smith, Stevens, J Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler, Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Churchill, Darcy, Deacon, Downie, Drean, Fletcher, Foster, James, Jordan, Kelly, Goslin, Leaves, Mrs Leaves, Nicholson, Mrs Pengelly, Corvid, Buchan, Derrick, Mavin, Winter, Mrs Loveridge, Cook and R Smith.

Against the motion (0)

Abstentions (1)
Lord Mayor

Absent / Did Not Vote (7)
Councillors Dr Mahony, Mrs Bridgeman, Neil, Carson, K Taylor, Wiggins and Mrs Johnson.

(Councillor Wiggins was absent due to interests declared)

17. Independent Remuneration Panel Review Report

Councillor Pete Smith (Deputy Leader) proposed the recommendations of the Independent Remuneration Panel for Council approval, Councillor Evans OBE (Leader) seconded the proposal.

Following a debate and vote the council agreed –

- I. the eight recommendations from the Independent Remuneration Panel on the level of Members' Allowances from 2018/19 onwards as follows:

Recommendation 1: Having reviewed the Bands for the Special Allowances, the Panel recommends a change to the existing Band 5 to be a quarter of the basic allowance. For 2018/19 this will be £2,697.

Recommendation 2: The Panel recommends the four Scrutiny Committee Chairs each receive a Special Responsibility Allowance at Band 3, which is £10,788 for 2018/19.

Recommendation 3: The Panel recommends the four Scrutiny Committee Vice-Chairs are not remunerated and therefore will not attract a Special Responsibility Allowance.

Recommendation 4: The Panel recommends, in recognition of the role of Vice-Chairs of Licensing and Taxi Licensing, which are quasi-judicial committees, that they receive a Special Responsibility Allowance at new Band 5, £2,697.

Recommendation 5: The Panel recommends the role of Chair of the Health and Wellbeing Board should, in principle, be remunerated. On the basis of the evidence the Panel considers the role should be remunerated at Band 4 which is currently £5,394 for 2018/19.

Recommendation 6: The Panel recommends an increase in the Special Responsibility Allowance for the Chair of Audit and Governance Committee from the current Band 4, £5,394 for 2018/19, to Band 3, £10,788.

Recommendation 7: The Panel recommends the proposed new role of Assistant Cabinet Member be remunerated with a Special Responsibility Allowance at the new Band 5 level of £2,697 for 2018/19, on the expectation that:

- the number of roles is restricted to a maximum of four at any one time;
- a rolling programme of development for the Assistant Cabinet Members be introduced, in the context of the broader approach to Member development and succession planning; and
- evidence is provided to the next review of the Panel on the effectiveness of the Assistant Cabinet Member role.

Recommendation 8: The Panel recommends in the interests of parity, the subsistence rates for officers and Members continue to be linked as articulated in the 'Plymouth Book'.

2. to note the next full review of member allowances will take place by 2021; and
3. to delegate to the Monitoring Officer responsibility for undertaking the necessary updates to Appendix One of the Council's Constitution to reflect the agreed member allowances from 2018/19.

For the motion (27)

Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Haydon, Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, McDonald, Morris, Murphy, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Penberthy, Rennie, Singh, P Smith, Stevens, J Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Winter, Wheeler, Mavin, Buchan, Goslin, Corvid and Derrick.

Against the motion (22)

Councillors Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Churchill, Darcy, Deacon, Downie, Drear, Fletcher, Foster, James, Jordan, Kelly, Leaves, Mrs Leaves, Nicholson, Mrs Pengelly, Wiggins, Mrs Loveridge, Cook and R Smith.

Abstentions (1)

Lord Mayor

Absent / Did Not Vote (6)

Councillors Dr Mahony, Mrs Bridgeman, Neil, Carson, K Taylor and Mrs Johnson.

18. **Scrutiny Minutes Approval and Minor Amendments to Terms of Reference**

Councillor Mrs Aspinall (Chair – Health and Social Care Overview and Scrutiny Committee) proposed the Scrutiny Committee minutes and minor amendments to Scrutiny Terms of

Reference for approval, Councillor Haydon (Cabinet Member for Customer Focus and Community Safety) seconded the proposals.

For the motion (49)

Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Haydon, Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, McDonald, Morris, Murphy, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Penberthy, Rennie, Singh, P Smith, Stevens, J Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler, Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Churchill, Darcy, Deacon, Downie, Drean, Fletcher, Foster, James, Jordan, Kelly, Goslin, Leaves, Mrs Leaves, Nicholson, Mrs Pengelly, Corvid, Buchan, Derrick, Mavin, Wiggins, Winter, Mrs Loveridge, Cook and R Smith.

Against the motion (0)

Abstentions (1)

Lord Mayor

Absent / Did Not Vote (6)

Councillors Dr Mahony, Mrs Bridgeman, Neil, Carson, K Taylor, and Mrs Johnson.

19. **Annual Report on Treasury Management Activities for 2017/18**

Councillor Stevens (Chair of Planning Committee) in his role as an Audit and Governance Committee Member, proposed approval of the Annual Report of Treasury Management Activities for 2017/18. Councillor Lowry (Cabinet member for Finance) seconded the proposal.

For the motion (49)

Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Haydon, Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, McDonald, Morris, Murphy, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Penberthy, Rennie, Singh, P Smith, Stevens, J Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler, Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Churchill, Darcy, Deacon, Downie, Drean, Fletcher, Foster, James, Jordan, Kelly, Goslin, Leaves, Mrs Leaves, Nicholson, Mrs Pengelly, Corvid, Buchan, Derrick, Mavin, Winter, Wiggins, Mrs Loveridge, Cook and R Smith.

Against the motion (0)

Abstentions (1)

Lord Mayor

Absent / Did Not Vote (6)

Councillors Dr Mahony, Mrs Bridgeman, Neil, Carson, K Taylor, and Mrs Johnson.

20. **Motions on notice**

- (i) Adoption of International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) definition of anti-Semitism

Councillor Morris (Chair of the Brexit, Infrastructure and Legislative Change

Overview and Scrutiny Committee) proposed a motion concerning the Adoption of International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance definition of anti-Semitism, Councillor Corvid seconded the proposals.

Councillor Kelly introduced an amendment which was seconded by Councillor Deacon. Following a short debate and vote the amendment was carried.

For the motion (48)

Councillors Aspinall, Haydon, Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, McDonald, Morris, Murphy, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Penberthy, Rennie, Singh, P Smith, Stevens, J Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Churchill, Darcy, Deacon, Downie, Drean, Fletcher, Foster, James, Jordan, Kelly, Goslin, Leaves, Mrs Leaves, Nicholson, Mrs Pengelly, Corvid, Buchan, Derrick, Mavin, Winter, Wiggins, Mrs Loveridge, Cook and R Smith.

Against the motion (0)

Abstentions (1)

Lord Mayor

Absent / Did Not Vote (7)

Councillors Dr Mahony, Mrs Bridgeman, Neil, Carson, K Taylor, Wheeler, and Mrs Johnson.

A motion to move to the vote was proposed by Councillor Rennie and seconded by Councillor P Smith. The motion was carried.

For the motion (26)

Councillors Aspinall, Haydon, Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, McDonald, Morris, Murphy, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Penberthy, Rennie, Singh, P Smith, Stevens, J Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Goslin, Mavin, Winter, Corvid, Buchan and Derrick.

Against the motion (22)

Councillors Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Churchill, Darcy, Deacon, Downie, Drean, Fletcher, Foster, James, Jordan, Kelly, Leaves, Mrs Leaves, Nicholson, Mrs Pengelly, Wiggins, Mrs Loveridge, Cook and R Smith.

Abstentions (0)

Absent / Did Not Vote (8)

Lord Mayor, Councillors Dr Mahony, Mrs Bridgeman, Neil, Carson, K Taylor, Wheeler, and Mrs Johnson.

Following a short debate and vote Council agreed –

- (1) condemn antisemitism in all its manifestations.
- (2) adopt the above definition of antisemitism as set out by the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance and pledges to combat this pernicious

form of racism wherever it appears and by whomever is it perpetrated

- (3) The Chief Executive be instructed to write to all national Party Leaders urging them to take the lead from Plymouth when formulating future policy in relation to the issue of anti-Semitism.

For the motion (48)

Lord Mayor, Councillors Aspinall, Haydon, Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, McDonald, Morris, Murphy, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Penberthy, Rennie, Singh, P Smith, Stevens, J Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler, Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Churchill, Darcy, Deacon, Downie, Drean, Fletcher, Foster, James, Jordan, Kelly, Goslin, Leaves, Mrs Leaves, Nicholson, Mrs Pengelly, Corvid, Buchan, Derrick, Mavin, Winter, Wiggins, Cook and R Smith.

Against the motion (0)

Abstentions (0)

Absent / Did Not Vote (8)

Councillors Mrs Loveridge, Dr Mahony, Mrs Bridgeman, Neil, Carson, K Taylor, Wheeler and Mrs Johnson.

- (ii) Cross Country Passenger Rail Franchise Public Consultation
Councillor Evans OBE (Leader), proposed a motion regarding the Cross Country Rail Franchise. Councillor P Smith (Deputy Leader) seconded the motion.

Following a short debate council agreed –

- 1) That in its response to the consultation Council should make clear that the proposals as they stand affect Plymouth and should be rejected.
- 2) To ask for the Peninsula Rail Task Force to campaign against these changes to these Plymouth services.

For the motion (48)

Lord Mayor, Councillors Aspinall, Haydon, Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, McDonald, Morris, Murphy, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Penberthy, Rennie, Singh, P Smith, Stevens, J Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Churchill, Darcy, Deacon, Downie, Drean, Fletcher, Foster, James, Jordan, Kelly, Goslin, Leaves, Mrs Leaves, Nicholson, Mrs Pengelly, Corvid, Buchan, Derrick, Mavin, Winter, Wiggins, Mrs Loveridge, Cook and R Smith.

Against the motion (0)

Abstentions (0)

Absent / Did Not Vote (8)

Councillors Dr Mahony, Vincent, Wheeler, Mrs Bridgeman, Neil, Carson, K Taylor, and Mrs Johnson.

(iii) **Building the next Fleet Solid Support Ships in the UK and securing work for Plymouth**

Councillor Evans OBE (Leader), proposed a motion regarding Building the next Fleet Solid Support Ships in the UK. Councillor P Smith (Deputy Leader) seconded the motion.

Following a short debate council agreed to support the campaign which is to be launched in Plymouth on the 13th July 2018.

For the motion (46)

Lord Mayor, Councillors Aspinall, Haydon, Coker, Dann, Evans OBE, Hendy, Lowry, McDonald, Morris, Murphy, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Penberthy, Rennie, Singh, P Smith, Stevens, J Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Churchill, Darcy, Deacon, Downie, Drean, Fletcher, Foster, James, Jordan, Kelly, Goslin, Leaves, Mrs Leaves, Mrs Pengelly, Corvid, Buchan, Derrick, Mavin, Wigans, Mrs Loveridge, Cook and R Smith.

Against the motion (0)

Abstentions (1)

Councillor Nicholson

Absent / Did Not Vote (9)

Councillors Dr Mahony, Mrs Bridgeman, Vincent, Wheeler, Winter, Neil, Carson, K Taylor and Mrs Johnson.

21. **Questions by Councillors**

	From	To	Topic
1	Cllr Stevens	Cllr P Smith	Library services, tier 1 and 2 services in libraries.
2	Cllr Mrs Beer	Cllr Coker	Traffic management for HGV in Plympton St Maurice and Underwood.
3	Cllr Buchan	Cllr Dann	Waste collection services.
4	Cllr Ball	Cllr Coker	Charging points for electric vehicles.
5	Cllr Kelly	Cllr Dann	Alternative weekly collections.
6	Cllr Goslin	Cllr Dann	Signage for Dogs on leads in Central Park.

7	Cllr R Smith	Cllr Evans	Member Development
8	Cllr Downie	Cllr Penberthy	Unauthorised Encampments.
9	Cllr Nicholson	Cllr Dann	Dogs in Central Park.
10	Cllr Mrs Leaves	Cllr Dann	Policy on Trees.
11	Cllr Jordan	Cllr Penberthy	Charging points for electric vehicles.
12	Cllr Beer	Cllr Dann	Slurry Sealing on pavements.
13	Cllr Buchan	Cllr Penberthy	Chaucer Way development construction.

Please note that questions, answers, supplementary questions and supplementary answers have been summarised.